

The Hon. David W. Christel

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON AT SEATTLE

**TRAVELERS PROPERTY CASUALTY COMPANY
OF AMERICA, a foreign insurer,**

No. 2:22-cv-0589 DWC

Plaintiffs,

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

WALSH CONSTRUCTION COMPANY II, LLC, an Illinois Limited Liability Company; and ARCH SPECIALTY INSURANCE COMPANY, a foreign insurer,

NOTED: JANUARY 24, 2023

Defendants.

WALSH CONSTRUCTION COMPANY II, LLC, an Illinois Limited Liability Company,

Third Party Plaintiff,

V.

GREENWICH INSURANCE COMPANY, a foreign insurer

Third Party Defendant.

1 **1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

2 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or
 3 private information for which special protection may be warranted. This is an insurance coverage
 4 dispute arising out of the underlying claim, entitled *King County v. Walsh Construction Company,*
 5 *II, LLC, et. al.*, in King County Superior Court Cause No. 20-2-13747-2 SEA (“the Underlying
 6 Litigation”). Because this lawsuit (the “Coverage Action”) is proceeding simultaneously with the
 7 Underlying Litigation, there is a risk that Walsh’s adversary in the Underlying Litigation could
 8 gain access to information that might unfairly prejudice Walsh in the Underlying Litigation.
 9 Similarly, because Walsh and one of its adversaries in the Underlying Litigation, Underground
 10 Solutions, Inc (“UGSI”), are both insured by Travelers Property Casualty Co. (“Travelers”), there
 11 is a risk that adjusters representing UGSI’s interest could gain access to information that might
 12 unfairly prejudice Walsh.

13 Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following
 14 Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this agreement is consistent with LCR
 15 26(c). It does not confer blanket protection on all disclosures or responses to discovery, the
 16 protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or
 17 items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles, and it does
 18 not presumptively entitle parties to file confidential information under seal.

19 **2. “CONFIDENTIAL” MATERIAL**

20 2.1 *Materials Designated as Confidential.* “Confidential” material shall include the
 21 following documents and tangible things produced or otherwise exchanged:

- 22 (a) all material produced in the Underlying Litigation that is subject to any
 23 order of confidentiality by the court overseeing the Underlying Litigation;
- 24 (b) Confidential Defense Material as defined below; and
- 25 (c) Confidential Coverage Material as defined below.

26 2.2 *Definition of Confidential Defense Material.* “Confidential Defense Material”
 27 includes material containing information related to the Underlying Litigation to the extent it is
 28 protected from disclosure as work product, privileged, developed in anticipation of litigation,

1 confidential settlement communications, or otherwise protected from disclosure by the Federal Rules
2 of Civil Procedure, Federal Rules of Evidence, or under the comparable procedural and evidence rules
3 applicable in the Underlying Litigation. This includes specifically, without limitation, any information
4 related to the Underlying Litigation in the possession of any insurance adjusters or claims personnel
5 involved in handling the Underlying Litigation on behalf of Walsh. Except to the extent subject to an
6 order of confidentiality entered in the Underlying Litigation, “Confidential Defense Material”
7 hereunder does not include any documents or information produced by any Party in the Underlying
8 Litigation to any other Party in the Underlying Litigation in response to a discovery request from a
9 Party in the Underlying Litigation, or filed with the Court in the Underlying Litigation.

10 2.3 *Definition of Confidential Coverage Material.* “Confidential Coverage Material”
11 includes material containing information regarding the investigation and evaluation of insurance
12 benefits for Walsh in regard to the claims asserted against it in the Underlying Litigation to the
13 extent it is protected from disclosure as work product, privileged, information developed in
14 anticipation of litigation or otherwise protected from disclosure by the Federal Rules of Civil
15 Procedure or Federal Rules of Evidence.

16 **3. SCOPE**

17 The protections conferred by this agreement cover not only confidential material (as
18 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from confidential material; (2) all
19 copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of confidential material; and (3) any testimony,
20 conversations, or presentations by parties or their counsel that might reveal confidential material.
21 However, the protections conferred by this agreement do not cover information that is in the public
22 domain or becomes part of the public domain through trial or otherwise.

23 **4. ACCESS TO AND USE OF CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL**

24 4.1 *Basic Principles.* A receiving party may use confidential material that is disclosed
25 or produced by another party or by a non-party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,
26 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Confidential material may be disclosed only to the
27 categories of persons and under the conditions described in this agreement. Confidential material
28

1 must be stored and maintained by a receiving party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures
2 that access is limited to the persons authorized under this agreement.

3 4.2 *Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items.* Unless otherwise ordered
4 by the court or permitted in writing by the designating party, a receiving party may disclose any
5 confidential material only to:

- (a) the receiving party's counsel of record in this action, as well as employees of counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;
 - (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including in house counsel) of the receiving party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation (under this clause, Travelers is required to protect from disclosure any "CONFIDENTIAL" information from any and all Travelers personnel involved in the handling or adjusting of UGSI's insurance claim related to the Underlying Litigation), unless the parties agree that a particular document or material produced is for Attorney's Eyes Only and is so designated;
 - (c) experts and consultants to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);
 - (d) the court, court personnel, and court reporters and their staff;
 - (e) copy or imaging services retained by counsel to assist in the duplication of confidential material, provided that counsel for the party retaining the copy or imaging service instructs the service not to disclose any confidential material to third parties and to immediately return all originals and copies of any confidential material;
 - (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the

designating party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal confidential material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this agreement;

(g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

4.3 Filing Confidential Material. Before filing confidential material or discussing or referencing such material in court filings, the filing party shall confer with the designating party, in accordance with Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(A), to determine whether the designating party will remove the confidential designation, whether the document can be redacted, or whether a motion to seal or stipulation and proposed order is warranted. During the meet and confer process, the designating party must identify the basis for sealing the specific confidential information at issue, and the filing party shall include this basis in its motion to seal, along with any objection to sealing the information at issue. Local Civil Rule 5(g) sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal. A party who seeks to maintain the confidentiality of its information must satisfy the requirements of Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(B), even if it is not the party filing the motion to seal. Failure to satisfy this requirement will result in the motion to seal being denied, in accordance with the strong presumption of public access to the Court's files.

5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 *Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.* Each party or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this agreement must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The designating party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify, so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this agreement.

1 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are
2 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to
3 unnecessarily encumber or delay the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses
4 and burdens on other parties) expose the designating party to sanctions.

5 If it comes to a designating party's attention that information or items that it designated for
6 protection do not qualify for protection, the designating party must promptly notify all other parties
7 that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

8 5.2 *Manner and Timing of Designations.* Except as otherwise provided in this
9 agreement (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(b) below), or as otherwise stipulated or
10 ordered, disclosure or discovery material that qualifies for protection under this agreement must
11 be clearly so designated before or when the material is disclosed or produced.

12 (a) Information in documentary form: (e.g., paper or electronic documents and
13 deposition exhibits, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial
14 or trial proceedings), the designating party must affix the word
15 "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains confidential material. If only
16 a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the
17 producing party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by
18 making appropriate markings in the margins).

19 (b) Testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial proceedings: the parties
20 and any participating non-parties must identify on the record, during the
21 deposition or other pretrial proceeding, all protected testimony, without
22 prejudice to their right to so designate other testimony after reviewing the
23 transcript. Any party or non-party may, within fifteen days after receiving
24 the transcript of the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, designate
25 portions of the transcript, or exhibits thereto, as confidential. If a party or
26 non-party desires to protect confidential information at trial, the issue
27 should be addressed during the pre-trial conference.

(c) Other tangible items: the producing party must affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the word "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the producing party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

6 5.3 *Inadvertent Failures to Designate.* If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
7 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the designating party's
8 right to secure protection under this agreement for such material. Upon timely correction of a
9 designation, the receiving party must make reasonable efforts to ensure that the material is treated
10 in accordance with the provisions of this agreement.

11 | P a g e | 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

12 6.1 *Timing of Challenges.* Any party or non-party may challenge a designation of
13 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a designating party's confidentiality
14 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic
15 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a party does not waive its right to
16 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the
17 original designation is disclosed.

18 6.2 *Meet and Confer.* The parties must make every attempt to resolve any dispute
19 regarding confidential designations without court involvement. Any motion regarding confidential
20 designations or for a protective order must include a certification, in the motion or in a declaration
21 or affidavit, that the movant has engaged in a good faith meet and confer conference with other
22 affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action. The certification must list
23 the date, manner, and participants to the conference. A good faith effort to confer requires a face-
24 to-face meeting or a telephone conference.

25 6.3 *Judicial Intervention.* If the parties cannot resolve a challenge without court
26 intervention, the designating party may file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under Local
27 Civil Rule 7 (and in compliance with Local Civil Rule 5(g), if applicable). The burden of
28 persuasion in any such motion shall be on the designating party. Frivolous challenges, and those

1 made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on
2 other parties) may expose the challenging party to sanctions. All parties shall continue to maintain
3 the material in question as confidential until the court rules on the challenge.

4 **7. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN**
5 **OTHER LITIGATION**

6 If a party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels
7 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that party
8 must:

- 9 (a) promptly notify the designating party in writing and include a copy of the subpoena
10 or court order;
- 11 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in
12 the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order
13 is subject to this agreement. Such notification shall include a copy of this
14 agreement; and
- 15 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the
16 designating party whose confidential material may be affected.

17 **8. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

18 If a receiving party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed confidential
19 material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this agreement, the receiving
20 party must immediately (a) notify in writing the designating party of the unauthorized disclosures,
21 (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the protected material, (c) inform the
22 person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this agreement,
23 and (d) request that such person or persons execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be
24 Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

25 **9. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE**
26 **PROTECTED MATERIAL**

27 When a producing party gives notice to receiving parties that certain inadvertently
28 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the

1 receiving parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision
2 is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order or
3 agreement that provides for production without prior privilege review. The parties agree to the
4 entry of a non-waiver order under Fed. R. Evid. 502(d) as set forth herein.

5 **10. NON TERMINATION AND RETURN OF DOCUMENTS**

6 Within 60 days after the termination of this action, including all appeals, each receiving
7 party must return all confidential material to the producing party, including all copies, extracts and
8 summaries thereof. Alternatively, the parties may agree upon appropriate methods of destruction.

9 Notwithstanding this provision, counsel are entitled to retain one archival copy of all
10 documents filed with the court, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, correspondence,
11 deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work
12 product, even if such materials contain confidential material.

13 The confidentiality obligations imposed by this agreement shall remain in effect until a
14 designating party agrees otherwise in writing or a court orders otherwise.

16 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

17 FRIEDMAN | RUBIN, PLLP

LETHER LAW GROUP

20 *s/Richard Dykstra*
Richard Dykstra, WSBA# 5114
21 Alexander E. Ackel, WSBA #52073
Attorneys for Walsh Const. Co. II

s/N. Chance Laboda
Thomas Lether, WSBA# 18089
N. Chance Laboda, WSBA #54273
Attorneys for Travelers Property Casualty Co.

23 COZEN O'CONNOR

LANE POWELL PC

25 *s/William F. Knowles*
William F. Knowles, WSBA# 17212
26 Peter Berg, WSBA# 46757
Attorneys for Arch Specialty Insurance Co.

s/Avin S. Singh
Stephania Denton, WSBA No. 21920
Avin S. Singh, WSBA No. 51759
Attorneys for Third-Party Defendant Greenwich Insurance Co.

1 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED
2
3

4 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that pursuant to Fed. R. Evid. 502(d), the production of any
5 documents in this proceeding shall not, for the purposes of this proceeding or any other federal or
6 state proceeding, constitute a waiver by the producing party of any privilege applicable to those
7 documents, including the attorney-client privilege, attorney work-product protection, or any other
privilege or protection recognized by law.

8 DATED this 25th day of January, 2023.
9

10 
11

12 David W. Christel
13 United States Magistrate Judge
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington on [date] in the case of _____ [insert formal name of the case and the number and initials assigned to it by the court]. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

Date:

City and State where sworn and signed:

Printed name:

Signature: